

*AIDS TO READING PERSIAN MSS. IN VIEW  
OF EDITORIAL WORK*

INTRODUCTION.

IN the study of a Persian MS an important consideration is the individuality of the Copyist, so far, at least, as this may be diagnosed from an attentive perusal of his work as a whole. Each Copyist has his individual peculiarities and mode of writing, and we must of course, by close observation and comparison, become familiar with these in order to read him.

With regard to the errors which so commonly occur in Persian MSS. it should be observed that most of these are due to the carelessness or misconception of the Copyist in his use of the Arabic script—a script which lends itself peculiarly to error—and it is the purpose of this essay to point out a number of cases in which such carelessness or misconception may tend to change one word into another, or to confuse the reading. Such tendencies to error are indeed common enough to furnish those who keep them constantly in view with some general alternatives, or even rules, by which they may in certain cases be guided.

A number of more general hints or remarks have been added on certain occasional or habitual peculiarities of Copyists as to which it is necessary to be on one's guard.

It need scarcely be observed that in the consideration of any passage these rules or hints are only subsidiary to a close study of the context and of the general trend of the Author's thought and argument, as well as to comparison with other MSS.

The Notes which follow have been prepared from two MSS. of the *Ilahi Nama* of 'Attâr—one in the British Museum written in *naskhi*, and dated 1410; the other in the Bodleian Library, in *nast'lik*, undated, but probably of the 17th Century—as well as from MSS. in the India Office, others in the British Museum, and an Indian (Lakhnau) lithographed edition of 1872.

The *Ilahi Nama* is one of the most interesting of the moral and Sûfi works of 'Attâr, the second of the three great Sûfi poets—the first being Sanâ'î, and the third Rûmî. It is treated in a way rather characteristic of 'Attâr, which he follows also in his *Mantiku 't-Tair*; that is to say, the supposed teacher of the moral and Sûfi maxims is a personage introduced into the poem, and not the Author himself. Here the teacher is a Khalif, the father of six sons, on each of whom in turn he inculcates these maxims in the form of interesting stories.

Besides the *Ilahi Nama*, 'Attâr wrote more than thirty works of great interest for Sûfism, and it is remarkable that of all those only the *Mantiku 't-Tair*, and a small treatise, the *Pand Nama*, have been published in texts and translations—the former very unsatisfactorily, the latter as became a scholar so far in advance of his time as the Baron Sylvestre de Sacy.

In the older MSS. (let us now resume), especially those written in *naskhi*, we have to deal with various archaisms which do not occur in the later MSS., and the present writer may perhaps be excused for expressing his personal opinion that the retention of these in a printed text is not only unnecessary but also confusing.

Among such archaisms may be more particularly mentioned the dot over the letter *dal* in certain cases, the sign *sukun* often suffixed, the form *ank* for *anki*, and the sign *hamza* suffixed to a mute *he* before a vowel sound in the next word, to show that a *spiritus lenis* and not *h* must be heard before the vowel sound. As a matter of fact, however, no one who could spell *would* pronounce the *h* and the *hamza* only confuses the reading, since it may easily be taken for a *hamza* of more significance.

So far, we have for the most part been considering the mistakes made in words, but for the purpose of forming a satisfactory text we have also to take into account the general merits of the Copyist, and to consider how far he is qualified to perform his task. The necessity for this arises from the fact that in far too many cases the Copyist constitutes himself also an Editor, and exercises his individual judgment (or, generally, want of judgment) for the purpose of producing what he considers a satisfactory text. The most flagrant example of this is found in his addition in many places of superfluous verses to a poem. When the Author has fully and clearly expressed his thought, and any addition would only dilute and weaken it, the Copyist in his wisdom often thinks that some

amplification or explanation is required, and adds a number of verses of his own. These spurious verses, however, may be fairly easily detached by any Editor who has sufficient experience and judgment for the task.

In the present case, however, we are dealing chiefly, as mentioned above, with the mistakes made in words, and we are fortunate in possessing two MSS. so authoritative as those of the British Museum and the Bodleian Library, since, in their more general correctness, they help us materially in the detection of such alternatives, rules, and habitual or occasional errors as form the subject of the present essay.

The MSS. of 'Attâr's works are on the whole notoriously corrupt, and for a translation which I have made of his *Ilahi Nama* I have been guided mainly by these two, of which, however, the British Museum MS. of 1410 is the more trustworthy. Additional MSS. consulted have been others in the British Museum, and several in the India Office. The Indian (Lakhnau) edition of 1872, which I have also used, is remarkable as following rather closely the B.M. MS. of 1410, but it is subject to the vagaries common to most Indian lithographs.

The Bodleian MS. differs to some extent in certain places (especially in the Introduction) from that of the British Museum, but the India Office MSS. are generally so different and evidently so corrupt as to be of little use for the formation of a text, though they help to serve the purpose of this essay, for which, of course, inferior MSS. are as indispensable as superior ones.

A number of the following Notes may be adopted as rules, but the majority are rather of the nature of cautionary suggestions which it is well to keep in mind when the sense of passages cannot be well made out from readings afforded. They may, I think, be followed with sufficient confidence, since only such alternatives have been offered as resemble one another enough to make them plausible.

They are corroborated too by the fact that the alternative preferred by me in my (unpublished) text of the *Ilahi Nama* makes good sense, whereas the alternative rejected does not. At the same time the alternatives offered here are (with the exception of one or two emendations) in no case conjectural, but are all supported by quotations from the MSS. consulted—quotations sufficiently long to serve as independent passages intelligible to the reader, and to justify my choice out of the

alternatives presented. The length of the quotations will also, I think, afford some additional interest to the subject and make it more generally acceptable.

The Notes, though not very numerous, are, I think, sufficient, when supported by the studies and investigations previously mentioned, to help appreciably in the formation of a text, and to afford a nucleus for a more extensive treatise on the subject. The labour of the study and collation of MSS., however, being so great, the production of anything like a terminal essay would be a work of years, and in the meantime the reader must make the best use he can of this *عجالة الوقت*

I have quoted the passages in which the correct alternative, as I take it, is found from my own (unpublished) text, in order to make them as intelligible as possible. Preceding (them in a single hemistich), is given the incorrect alternative, and following them a translation. I have also given a short abstract of each Story from which the passages have been taken, as an additional help towards understanding them.

The British Museum MS. is alluded to as B.M., that of the Bodleian Library as B.L., those of the India Office as I.O. 559, 350, and the Indian lithographed edition as I.E. This last I have taken as MS. since the Editor, I think, may be considered not only as an Editor but also as a Copyist.

In the Notes following, the alternatives discussed have been overlined.

Many more examples of each one might have been quoted if it had seemed necessary.

### *WORDS CONFUSED.*

ای for این

[On an intensely cold and snowy winter's night Sultân Malik Shâh, the Seljûkide, wonders if any one is keeping guard, and looks out of his tent. He sees no guard, but only a poor stranger lying down in the snow, and in devotion to the Sultan doing the office of one. In reward for this he is promoted by the Sultan to high honours ].

I. O. 559, 350 (Discourse 12) :

مذم این مهربان سلطان عالی

B.M, B.L, L.E.

زبانگ پای سلطان مرد از راه بجست از جای و بانگی زد بران شاه  
 کم ها ن تو کیستی شمع گفت حالی منم ای مهر بان سلطان عالی  
 تو باری کیستی ای مرد کاری کم سلطان را چنین شب پاس داری  
 زبان بکشاد مرد و گفت ای شاه منم مرد غریبی بی وطن گاه  
 وطن گاه هم بجزد ر گاه شمع نیست مرا جز خدمت شمع هیچ ره نیست  
 مرا تا جان و تن همراه باشد سرم آنجا کم پای شاه باشد

“At the sound of the Sultan’s footsteps the man sprang from his place on the road and shouted to the King :

“ Ho, there ; who are you ?” The King immediately said :

“ I am the exalted Sultan, O friendly man. But who, pray, are you, O active man, who on such a night guard the King ?”

“The man opened his mouth and said : “ O King, I am a stranger with no home to call my own.

“I have no place of abode save the King’s threshold ; I have no course save the service of the king.

“So long as my soul and body are in company my head will be there where is the foot of the King.”

این for ای . .

[ Alexander, the Great, is wandering in the land of darkness in search of the Water of Life, when he comes across a great, resplendent ruby, and thinks it is for his guidance in the darkness, but hears by a voice from the Unseen that it is to guide a great swarm of ants to their abode when astray ; and through this he receives a discouraging lesson on his own littleness.]

B. M. (Discourse 14) :

خطاب آمد که ای شمع فروزان

B.L., L.E.

چو شد عاجز دران تاریکی راه بهما زده هم سپهر حیران و هم شاه  
 بدد آمد قوی یکپاره یا قوت که دروی خیره گردد مرد و مبهوت



هزاران مور را میدید هر سوی که می رفتند هر یک از دگر سوی  
چنان پنداشت کان یا قوت پاره برای عجز او گشت آشکاره  
خطاب آمد که این شمع فروزان برای خیل موران است سوزان  
که تا بر نور آن موران گمراه شوند از جایگاه خویش آگاه  
مگر نو میدگشت آنجا سکندر که چون شد بهر موری سنگ گوهر

“When he had become frustrated by the obscurity of the road, and both army and King were bewildered,

“A great ruby came to view, at the sight of which one would become dazzled and stupefied.

“He saw on every side thousands of ants, each one hastening from a different direction.

“He thought that the ruby had come to light on account of his helplessness (in the dark).

“An address was vouchsafed him that this resplendent light was burning on account of the swarm of ants ;

“So that by the light the ants when astray might know where their abode was.

“Now Alexander grew hopeless there, thinking how stone had become a jewel for the sake of an ant.”

این for ای Another example of

[ The following Story treats of the instability of the world and its destruction of all those whom it has cherished].

B. M. (Discourse 17) :

کم نیست ای بس عجب ارگو سفزدان

B.L., L.E. : —

چنین گفت آن امیر در دزدان کم نیست این بس عجب از گو سفزدان  
که می آرند ایشان را بخواری که تا برند سرهاشان بزاری  
که بی عقلند ایشان می ندانند از آن سوی تغار خون دوانند  
از آن قصاب می باید عجب داشت که او هم علم داشت و هم طلب داشت  
چو میداند که او را نیز ناگاه بخوارندش بریدن سردرین راه  
چگونه فارغ و ایمن نشستم نمی جنبد ولی ساکن نشستم

“Thus spoke the Lord of the afflicted : “ It is not very wonderful in the case of sheep

“That they can drive them ignominiously to cut off their heads so wretchedly ;

“For they are without intelligence and know not ; hence they run towards the slaughter-house.

“But we must wonder at the butcher, who has knowledge and has pursued it—

“Knowing, as he does, that they will suddenly cut off his head also in this road—

“( We must wonder, I say) how he can settle down free from care and as if secure ; moving not, but settling down with a tranquil heart.”

کر for کان

[ The Story is of Alexander's journey in quest of the Water of Life and of a miraculous drum and a collyrium box. The following verse speaks of the last ].

L.E. (Discourse 14) :

دسی کان سر مره میلمی در کشید ی ر ماهی تا بساق عرش د ید ی

B.M., B. L. :

دسی کر سر مره میلمی در کشید ی ر ماهی تا بساق عرش د ید ی

“The person who with a style applied some of the collyrium would see from the Fish to the legs of the Higher Throne.”

پرسیدن for ترسیدن

[The Story describes how Nimrod as an infant is saved after a shipwreck, and subsequently, given great power, becomes inordinately proud and rebels against God. The littleness of worldly conceptions and of man is then spoken of].

I. O. 350 (Discourse 14) ;

چرمی ترسی کان لم تغن بالامس

B.M., B.L., I. O. 559, L. E,

نم از چرخ بر تر زود ر آموز که او هم سرنگون گردد شب و روز  
هم کار جهان از ذره تا شمس چه می پرسی کان لم تغن بالامس

(For the Arabic quotation see the Kur'ân. X.25. Here کان must be read for Ka'anna *mel causa*).

“You are not higher than the sky ; learn from it ; for it also plunges headlong (into the sea) night and day

“All the concerns of the world, from mote to sun— why do you inquire into them ? “ *The ground is bare as though it teemed not yesterday.*”

ا ز آ ن

(This may happen sometimes, though not always, through carelessness as to *madda* whilst the letter ze ( ز ) often becomes nun ( ن ), or *vice versa*).

[The inevitability of death. Even the earth at the bottom of the sea is constituted of the dust of the dead).

B.M., B.L. (Discourse 16) :

ند بدند ای عجب آن یک طلبگار

L.E. :

سلیم کوزه می خواست روزی که تا آبی خورد بی هیچ سوزی  
که آن کوزه نبوده باشد آنگاه ز خاک مرده افتاده در راه  
چنین خکی طلب کردند بسیدار اندیدند ای عجب از یک طلبگار

I. O. MSS. read differently 559 : چندین طلبگار ر :

چندان طلبگار

“Solomon asked for a jug one day, such that he might drink some water from it without any pain of heart :

“A jug that had not been made of the dust of some dead person fallen on the way.

“They had much search made for such earth, but, wondrous to relate ! they could not get it from any seeker.”



آن for ا ز

[The humility of a certain dying Shaikh who has so humble an opinion of his religious state that he expresses a wish not to be buried amongst Muslims].

I. O. 350 (Discourse 17) :

رسید از شیخ را عمرش به هشتاد

B.M., B.L., L.E. :

چو بود آن شیخ سالی شصت و هفتاد ز بعد آن مگرد ر نزع افتاد  
کی گفت ای بدان عالم قدم زن کجا د فتن کنم جائی رقم زن  
چنین گفت او کم من شورید ایمان نخواهم در بر جمعی مسلمان  
چو من نور مسلمان نی ندارم بگورستان دینداران چه کارم  
نخواهم با جهودان نیز همبر کم بیزار ست از ایشان پیمبر  
میان این دو گورستان زمینم بدست آور کم من نه زان نه زمینم

“A certain Shaikh reached the age of sixty or seventy ;  
after that he came to the point of death.

“One said to him: “O you who are proceeding to the other  
world, where shall I bury you ? write down a place.”

“He answered thus: “I, who am so astray from the Faith,  
do not wish to be buried near a number of Muslims :

“Since I have not in me the light of Islâm, what business  
have I in the grave-yard of the faithful ?

“But again, I cannot be a companion of the Jews, because  
the Prophet is averse to them.

“Get some ground for me between these two grave-yards,  
because I belong neither to the one nor to the other.”

این for ا ز

[In the story it is conceived that by the breath of the musk-deer taken in purity from the breath of dawn some of its blood is changed to musk. From this a Sûfi principle is evolved].

B. M. (Discourse 22) :

کم جان را کیمیا یست از الهی

B.L., L.E. :

کم داند آن چنان دم در جهانی که خون زو مشک گردد در زمانی  
چو خونی مشک گردد از دم پاک بود ممکن که روحانی شود خاک  
ولی چون نور حق در جان در آید تنّت حالی برنگ جان بر آید  
چه گویم بیش ازین امکان ندارد کم جانم بیش ازین فرمان ندارد  
اگر تو کیمیا سازی چنین ساز ولی این کیمیا در راه او باز  
چون نیست این کیمیا در عرش و کرسی ز جان خود طلب دیگر چه پرسى  
بسا ز این کیمیا گرمرد راهی کم جان را کیمیا نیست این الهی

“Who in the whole world knows of such a breath that through it in a moment blood becomes musk ?

“Since blood becomes musk through pure breath, it is possible that dust may become spirit.

“But when the Light of God enters the soul, your body immediately takes the colour of soul.

“What can I say ? There is no further possibility of speech for my soul has no command upon it beyond this.

“If you produce alchemy, produce it thus ; but devote this alchemy to Him.

“Since this alchemy is not in the ‘*Arsh and Kursi*, seek it from your own soul ; what ask you further ?

“Contrive this alchemy if you are a man of the Path ; for this for the soul is an alchemy divine.”

بہ for نہ

The misuse of these two, the negative and the emphatic often causes considerable difficulty, especially when the passage and context are intricate. An example of this confusion is seen in the following verses.

[Hârûn, the Khalif, encountering Buhlûl is severely admonished by him on his responsibilities, and on his exactions from the subjects. Then Hârûn asks some words of counsel from him].

B.M. (Discourse 16) :

و کر نہ من نگفتم بہ تو دانی

I. O. 559, and L. E. have نگفتم but read a little differently.

B. L. :

نصیحت خواست از بهلول هارون      بد و گفت آن زمان بهلول مجنون  
کم‌ای استاده برد نیا چنین راست      نشان اهل دوزخ بر تو پیدا است  
ز رویت محو گردان آن نشانی      و گر نه من بگفتم به تو دانی

Hârûn then asked some counsel of Buhlûl. Buhlûl, the insane, then spoke thus to him :

“O you who are so well and firmly established over the world, the marks of the damned are discernible in you.

“Efface those marks from your face ; these indeed are my words to you, but you know better.”

I think we may fairly well assume that نگفتم not بگفتم is correct here, though there is room for consideration, since we might assume the sense of B. M. to be :

“And indeed (you may take it that) I have not spoken, (for) you know better ;” but I scarcely think this a likely reading considering the context and the tone of Buhlûl.

همی for نمی

and *vice versa*.

One of these is often used wrongly for the other, but the following emendation must serve as an illustration, as I have not an example at hand. The emendation is, I think, supported by the subsequent verse, which without it seems a *non-sequitur*).

[The words following, which are at the end of a Story about Hârûn and Buhlûl, are moral reflexions of ‘Attâr on the short duration of life].

L. E. (Discourse 16) :

نمی ماند نمی مانی تو بر پای

B. M., B.L. :

نمی ماند کجا مایی تو بر پای

Emendation :

چوسنگی صد هزاران سال بر جای      همی ماند نمی ما نی تو بر پای  
چم خواهی کرد در جائی درنگی      کم آنجا بیدش ماند از تو سنگی

(In this, I am assuming for good and proper sense that the second verse is an apodosis to the first).

“ Since a rock endures for a hundred thousand years, (whilst) you subsist not (long).

“Why should you wish to linger in a place where a (mere) rock lasts longer than you ? ”

به and نه

(The order of the dots in these).

When the negative نه and the emphatic به are used together they are often written in the wrong order. نه should precede به but the reverse of this is often found.

(The angels, considering the great wealth of Abraham, doubt his entire devotion to God, but are ultimately convinced).

B.M., B.L. (Discourse 19) :

بنگد ارد خالی چون خلیاست

I. O. 559, L. E.

ملا یک چشم بوکا رش کشادند      زکارش درگمانی ا و فتادند  
کم او مشغول چندین گو سفندست      خدا میگوید او پاک و بلندست  
کم او مستغرق رب جلیاست      نه بگد ارد خالی چون خلیاست

اضافه (vocative particle) ای

ای and اضافه when long are frequently confused, from the fact that the Copyist evidently often wrote from dictation, and that the sound is almost identical. In the following example the evidence is in favour of اضافه).

[Advice given by Hallāj, the famous Sūfi, to his son].

L.E. (Discourse 19) :

پسر را گفت حلاج ای نکو کار

B.M., B.L.

پسر را گفت حلاج نکو کار بچیزی نفس را مشغول میدار  
وگرنه او ترا معزول دارد بصدنا کردنی مشغول دارد  
که تو در ره نهمرد قوی ذات ندانی زددمی هرگز بمیقات

“Hallāj, the beneficent said to his son : “ Keep your soul occupied with something ;

“Otherwise, it will depose you from good work, and keep you engaged in a hundred unworthy acts.

“For you are not a man of firm nature on the Path : you can never rest for a moment at the proper time and season.”

Another example of ای for اضافت

[The story is of the ill-starred love of Ka'b's daughter for a handsome slave. Her love, however, is only the expression through an earthly object of her love for the Deity in His all-transcendent beauty].

B.L. (Discourse 21) :

کم بشوقصم ای کبک سخن گوی

I. O. 559, 350.

دل از زخم غلامش آنچنان سوخت که در یک چشم زخمش نیز جان سوخت  
نبودش چشم زخمی خواب و آرام کم بر سر داشت زخمی آن دلا رام  
کجا میشد دل او آرامیده یکی نام نوشت از خون دیده  
چنین آورد در نظم آن سمن بوی کم بشوقصم کبک سخن گوی

“Her heart burnt so because of the slave's wound that her soul also at one fell stroke of the evil eye was burnt.



“She had no sleep or rest through the calamity of that charmer’s having a wound in the head.

“How indeed could her heart be at rest? She wrote a letter with the blood of her tearful eyes.

“That jasmine-scented one thus expressed her thoughts in verse : hear, you, the theme of the eloquent nightingale.”

(“Nightingale ; ” “lit.,” “partridge.”)

درهم for هر دم or بر هم

(In the following example I take درهم to be correct).  
Advice of Hallâj, the famous Sûfi, to his son.

I. O. 559 (Discourse 19) :

L. E. بغیبت می زد بر هم جها نی

B. L. بغیبت می کشد بر هم جها نی

B.M. بغیبت می کشد هر دم جها نی

شکم چون سیر گردد یک زمانت بغیبت گر سنم گردد ز با نت  
چو تیغی تیز بکشا ین ز با نی بغیبت می کزد ر هم جها نی  
بسی گر چه فرو گوئی بگو شش نیا ری کرد یک ساعت خموشش

“When your stomach becomes full for a moment, your tongue hungers after calumny.

“When a tongue draws a sharp sword in calumny, it throws a whole world into confusion.

“Although you speak much in its ear, you cannot silence it for a moment.”

If B. L. be correct, I think بغیبت instead of belonging to the first hemistich should be attached to the second. The sense of the distich would then be :

“When a tongue draws a sharp sword, it draws every moment a whole world into calumny.”

But this is scarcely satisfactory, since a tongue may be keen without being calumnious,

## ایندجا for آندجا

By the omission of dots and of the orthographical sign *madda* it is sometimes difficult to decide, without close attention to the context, which is correct.

[Advice of Hallâj, the famous Sûfî, to his son].

B.L. (Discourse 19):

عجب نبود گر آندجا شیر گرد د (a dot or dots omitted).  
Here آندجا is probably for ایندجا but, supposing a *madda* omitted, it might be آندجا

I. O. 559 :

عجب ایندست ایندجا شیر گرد د

L.E

عجب ایندست کا ایندجا شیر گرد د

B. M. :

ترا تا نفس می ماند خیا لی بود د ر مولشش د ا ثم کمالی  
اگر نفست ز ما نی سیز گرد د عجب نبود کم ا ایندجا شیر گرد د

“So long as your carnal soul remains before you as a spectre, perfection will lie in constantly putting it off.  
“If your carnal soul become satiated for a moment, it will be no wonder if it become here a lion.”

## تیره for نیز

تیره may occur for نیز by a slight separation of the two dots of the ت in تیره and the joining of the ه he (often slightly indicated) to the preceding....re.

[In the Story the Sûfî aspirant is admonished to weep plenteously until, with the loss of sight, true spiritual vision come].

B. L. (Discourse 20) :

د گرره نیز شد د و چشم گر یا نش

B. M., I. O. 559, 350, L. E. :

شعیب از شوق حق د ه سال بگریست ازان پس چشم پوشیده ه همی زیست  
خدا بینا ش کرد از بعد آن باز کم شد د ه سال د یگر خون فشان باز  
د گرره تیره شد د و چشم گریان ش د گرره چشم روزی کرد یزدانش

“Shu’aib from eager desire of God wept for ten years ;  
thenceforth he went on living blind.

“Afterwards God restored his sight again, and again he  
became a shedder of blood-stained tears for ten more years.

“Once more his two weeping eyes were darkened, and  
again God gave him sight.”

حمد for جمله

With alternatives apparently so unlike as نیر and نیز may be classed the above. The dissimilarity, however, is less when the ل is shortened, as it often is).

[Part of an invocation to God].

B. L. (Introduction to the Work):

I. O. 559 : مرا توفیق ده تا جمله خوانم

مرا توفیق ده تا حمد خوانم صفات ذات تو بر لفظ را نم  
زد رگها همین دارم اما نی مرا یا رب بدین مقصد رسانی  
سخن انجام شد آغا ز توحید کلام از حمد و از تمجید تمجید

“Give me Thy favouring help, that I may speak Thy  
praise; that I may express in words the attributes of Thine  
Essence.

“From thy Court I am in hope that Thou wilt enable me,  
O Lord, to reach my aim.

“The declaration of the Unity in the beginning is the end  
and aim of speech : I will sing to the glory of God in  
praise and repeated laudations.

مکر for فکر

[In the Story the son of a certain man begs his father to  
take him to the abode of a sage famous for his skill in  
medicine and astronomy, but so jealous of it that he never  
admits any one to his house. The son, however, by a  
cunning device, manages to gain the sage’s confidence and  
to learn all his secrets].

L. E. (Discourse 4):

بسرکردش ز فکر خویش آگاه

B. M., B. L. :

پسر گفتا کم آنجا بر نهانم کم من خود حیل این کار دانم  
 پسر شد با پدر القه در راه پسر کردش ز مکر خویش آگاه  
 کم پیش این حکیم نه دوان شو ز دل کینه برون کن مهر بان شو  
 بدو گوید کی دارم کرو لال ندارم نعمتی هستم مقل حال  
 برای آخرت بپذیرش از من چنین بارگران بر گیرش از من  
 کم تا در خدمت تو روزگاری کند چند انکس فرمائش کاری

The son rejoined : " Take me thither secretly, for I know how to manage this business."

In short, the son set out on the road with his father. The son acquainted him on the way with his scheme.

He said : " Go into the presence of the Indian Sage : Divest your heart of all ill-feeling and be friendly to him."

Say to him : ' I have a son who is deaf and dumb ; I have no wealth, I am in poor circumstances.

Take him of me for the sake of a future reward ; relieve me of this so heavy a load ;

That he for a time may in your service execute whatever commands you lay upon him."

گوید for گرید

[An example of this occurs in a Story about Joseph and his brethren].

L. E. (Discourse 3) :

چگو نه گرید آواز بیقراری

B. M., B. L.

بدو گفتا کم چون داری پدر را کم میگویند گم کرده پسر را  
 چنین گفت او کم نابینا بماند ست چو یوسف نیست و تنها بماند ست  
 جهانی آتشش در جان نشستم میان کلبم احران نشستم  
 چو از یوسف فراموش گیرد در آن ساعت مراد در پیش گیرد  
 چه گویم من کم آن ساعت بزاری چه گوید هر زمان از بیقراری

Then said he : “ what say you of the father—of him whom they call ‘ Bereaved of son ? ’ ”

He answered thus : “ He has become and is still blind ; since Joseph is not there, he remains all alone.

A world of fire is feeding on his soul ; he is seated in the hut of sorrows.

When his thoughts turn upon Joseph, at that time he brings me near him.

How can I describe how pitiably then he gives incessant utterance to his restless grief ! ”

( چنان for بدان )

This, perhaps, is slightly conjectural, and depends on the writing of the old B. M. MS. in which *dal* in certain positions is dotted. The conjecture, however, is supported by the reading of B. L. and L. E., namely چنين which is not so good as چنان but better than بدان which here has no sense.

[The Story is about Alexander and his search for the Water of Life and for a marvellous drum and collyrium-box of which he has read. He finds on his way through the land of darkness a great, resplendent ruby].

B. M. (Discourse 14.) :

( بدان for , ) بدان پنداشت کان یا قوت پوره

B. L., L. E. :

پد ید آ مد قوی یکپاره یا قوت کم دروی خیره گردد مرد و مبهوت

چنین پنداشت کان یا قوت پوره برای عجزا و گشت آشکاره

Emendation : چنان

“A great ruby came to view, at the sight of which one would become dazzled and stupefied.

“He thought that the ruby had come to light on account of his helplessness (in the dark).



چو for چم

[On the instability of the world and its destruction of all].

B. M. (Discourse 17) :

چم میداند کم اورا نیز ناگاه

L. E. :

(کم میداند کم اورا نیز ناگاه)

B. L. :

از آن قصاص می باید عجب داشت	کم او هم علم داشت و هم طلب داشت
چو میداند کم اورا نیز ناگاه	بخواهندش بریدن سر درین راه
چگونم فارغ و ایمن نشستم	نمی جنبد ولی ساکن نشستم

“But we must wonder at the butcher, who has knowledge and has pursued it—

“Knowing, as he does, that they will suddenly cut off his head also in this read—

“(We must wonder, I say) how he can settle down free from care and as if secure : moving not, but settling down with a tranquil heart.

زمان for زنان

*Mim* being often only slightly indicated, and one dot frequently doing the office of two for two adjoining letters, the Copyist may mistake a word like زمان for زنان

I. O. 559, (Discourse 16) :

چو دریا زان زنان برخاست جوشی

B. M., B.L. :

برآمد از پس پرده فر و شی      چو دریا آن زمان برخاست جوشی

*Dots.*

Dots omitted, or misplaced.

This is very frequently the case, and only experience and close study of the passage and the context as well as of other MSS. can afford the correct reading.

Under this heading may be considered cases where a dot is required *under* a letter in one line, and the same dot *above* a letter immediately below in the line beneath. In such cases one dot is often made to do the office of the two required.

Besides the very frequent omission or misplacement of dots due to sheer carelessness, we have the habitual writing of one dot for three in the letters چ ژ پ and the use of ک for گ

چ for چ and ب for پ

B. L. (Discourse 20) :

چوناگاهش نظر بر شاه افتاد } طعامی ساخت شهر را کرده بر زهر  
دل ما زین سگ بی دین بپرداز }

B. M.

بر }  
پرداز } جو

and

L. E. :

شنیدم کرد شیریل زنی داشت که آن زن شاه را چون دشمنی داشت

مگر یک روز آن زن از سر قهر طعامی ساخت شهر را کرده پر زهر  
چوناگاهش نظر بر شاه افتاد ز دستش کاسه در درگاه افتاد  
بلرزید و برفت از رنگ رویش از آن زن در گمان افتاد شویش  
طعام او بمرغ داد آنگاه بمرد آن مرغ و حیران ماند آن شاه  
بموبد داد زن را شاه عالی کم قالب کن ز قلبش زود خالی  
بریزش خون و در خاکش بینداز دل ما زین سگ بی دین بپرداز

"I have heard that the hero, King Ardashîr, had a wife who was inimical to him.

"Now one day the wife in anger brought some food to him filled with poison.

"When suddenly her glance fell upon the King, the plate fell from her hand upon the threshold.

"She trembled, and her face lost its colour ; her husband became suspicious of her.

"The king then gave the food to a bird ; the bird died, and the King remained astounded.

"He at once consigned the woman to a priest, and commanded him, saying : " Make void immediately her body of her heart.

"Shed her blood and cast her into the earth, free my heart from this conscienceless wretch."

ژ for ز

Such cases do not often occur, but I have met with زند

for زیان and زند for زیان

ک for گ

ک is found in all, or nearly all MSS. for گ (Very rarely گ might be written in the form گ).

Thus, e.g., we have کل for گل or گل for کران, گل for کران, گمان for گمان etc., etc.

Omission of dots ; with, at the same time, the closeness of words to one another.

From the practice of writing words so closely together it is often difficult to take them correctly, especially as most MSS. make no distinction between پ and ب

ک and گ ژ and ز چ and ج

As an example we may take the following from a Story about Joseph and Zulaikhâ in Discourse 20.

B.M., B.L., I. O., 559, 350, L. E., (Discourse 20) :

درآمد جبرئیل و گفت آنگاه که او را بر نمی گیریم از راه  
که او آنرا که ما را دوست دارد جهانی دوستی در پوست دارد  
چو او را دوستی او دوست پیوست مرا بهر تو با او دوستی هست  
که گفتند هر گاه در بوستان خواه هلاک دوستان و دشمنان خواه

که که عمری بچان گردانمش م. برای توجرات گردانمش من

But the correct reading is most probably چو آن since in the first hemistich it is not implied that she would be kept *young*, but simply *alive*; and besides this, she is supposed in the Story to be no longer young.

“Gabriel appeared and said “ We do not remove her from the road,

“Because for him who loves Us she has a world of love within her soul.

“Since she has always love for you, I have love for her for your sake.

“Who has said to you, ‘Seek the death of the rose in the garden; seek the destruction of the friends of My friends’—

“For if I keep her in life for a life-time, it is for your sake I keep her so.”

### *Dots combined*

The common practice of combining dots which belong to adjoining letters often causes considerable confusion, and close attention must be observed, especially where the writing is small, as in the B. M. *naskhi* MS. of 1410. The difficulty is increased in this by the Copyist's putting two dots under final *ye* (ی) Cf. e.g., بی for بی (in most MSS written بی).

As another example we have in the same MS. تنها for تنها

### *Dots superfluous.*

Dots are often inserted to avoid a slight space and to make the writing more even and symmetrical. We have an example of this in the Story of the wealthy Abraham and the doubts of the angels.

B. L. (Discourse 19) :

خطاب آمد از حق شوی ملایک

B. M., I. O. 559, L. E. :

خطاب آمد از حق شوی ملایک که هان چون بود ابراهیم ملایک

که چون جبریل نام نهاد کرد بذا هم نقدی ودا در د

An address reached the Angels from God : “ Now then !  
How is Abraham, the rich and powerful, in your sight ?  
For when Gabriel uttered My name, he devoted all his  
property to My name.”

*Letters confused.*

This occurs frequently, especially in small writing *Ha* ( ه ) may be confused with *vav* ( و ) ; and also with initial *mim* in the naskhi script. *Dal* ( د ) may be confused with *vav* ( و ), and also with *re* ( ر ) For the latter, cf. the numerous cases in the *Shah-nama* of بران for بران Initial *mim* ( م ) may be confused with initial *fe* ( ف ) if the dot be omitted.

For confusion through indistinctness, of *he* ( ه ) with *vav* ( و ) cf. B. M. (Discourse 15), in two verses of which it is difficult to see whether *he* or *vav* is meant.

[The Story is about Sultan Mahmūd and a bleacher, of whom the Sultan asks the price of all his bundle of linen].

B. M. (Discourse 15) :

د  
جوا بش داد گازر کامی شهنشا ه ترا کر با سد و گز بس د رین را ه

د  
چوزین جمله ترا د و گز پسند ست چرا پر سی زد یگر تا بچند ست

(Since the quantity is supposed to be enough for a shroud, I prefer د but in a later verse د is written distinctly, and B. L. and L. E. both read ده)

“The bleacher gave him answer: “ O great King, two ells of linen are enough for you in this path.

“Since two ells are sufficient for you out of all this, why do you ask the price of the rest ? ”

*Letters or syllables omitted.*

A letter or syllable may be omitted by inadvertence if the succeeding letter or syllable begin with an identical letter or syllable.

The following verse, quoted under another heading, is an example :



B. M. (Discourse 16) :

ز روی مهر کرده آن نشانی

B. L. ,L. E. :

ز روی مهر کرده آن نشانی

“ Obliterate that mark from your face.”

*Words repeated.*

The first word of a verse may, by a species of attraction be wrongly repeated as the first of the following verse

An example of this occurs in a Story about the Khalif. Ma'mûn and a favourite slave whose devotion he tests and finds subservient to self-interest.

B.,M., B.L., (Discourse 18) :

چنان آری در روی زهر آنگاه

L. E. :

چنان باید کم کوی و شهر و بازار همه بصره بیا را ئی بیکبار  
جلا ب آری در روی زهر آنگاه بروریزید و برگیریدش از راه

L. E. is here probably correct in writing جلا ب for چنان which latter gives no sense.

“ You are to adorn Basra throughout : city, streets, and markets. Then bring rose water with poison in it, pour it over him, and remove him from the path.”

*Orthographical signs.*

*Sukun*

*Sukun*, though not often written, is frequently found in some carefully written and old MSS., such as the B. M. *naskhi* MS. of 1410, in which the writing is so small that the *sukun* may easily be mistaken for the dot of a letter.

*Hamza*

It has been remarked in the Introduction that *hamza* may be suffixed to a mute *he* (ه) that immediately precedes a vowel sound, simply to indicate that a

*spiritus lenis*, and not the *h*, should be heard before the vowel sound, since the mute *he* must, of course, never be pronounced, though the vowel preceding it should be emphasised if the metre require a long syllable.

The insertion of this *hamza* is not only unnecessary but also confusing, as it may easily be mistaken for a *hamza* of more significance and it is so in the following : I. O. 559, 350, L. E. (Discourse 17) :

ندیدم چاره بیچاره گشتم

(Here the *hamza* is taken for *ya-ye tankir*).

B. M. :

سرایای جهان صد باره گشتم ندیدم چاره و بیچاره گشتم

(*Na-didam chara 'u bi-chara gashtam*).

B. L. reads the same, but omits *hamza*.

آنجا and اینجا

آن and این

Careful consideration is often necessary where these words are used, since the Copyist is frequently careless and writes one indiscriminately for the other, cf. the following verses in the *Masnavi* of Rûmî under the heading بقية قصة پیر چنگی و بیان مخلص آن (Book I. Bulâq edition).

The Harpist in his vision of the spiritual world is evidently speaking of the earth and the sky as distant from him hence اینجا and این would refer to the spiritual world, and آنجا and آن to the terrestrial.

کان زمین و آسمان بس فراخ کرد از تنگی دلم را شاخ شاخ  
وین جهانی کاند رین خوابم نمود در کشایش پر و بالم را کشود  
آن جهان در آهش ار پیدا شدی کم کسی یک اعظم اینجا بدو

The آن of verse three should of course be این and Bahru'l'Ulûm in his text and commentary reads so, Similarly اینجا should be اینجا

A further remark may be offered upon the misuse of *این* and *آن* when contrasted *این* properly means "the former," as being nearer to the speaker when he begins the verse; *آن* means "the latter," as being farther; but this rule is often ignored.

### *Conditional Past*

The 2nd Person Singular of the Past Conditional is, strange to say, unknown to the Grammars, and apparently to many of the Copyists, who attempting, in their ignorance of it, to afford the correct metre corrupt the text.

L. E. (Discourse 20) :

مرا گر چستی و اسباب و املاک ز رو سیمم ترا بودی هم پاک

I. O. 559 :

مرا گر چستی اسباب و املاک ز رو سیمم ترا بودی هم پاک

B.M., B. L. :

ز بیده گفت ای عاشق تو بر خویش چه خواهی کرد ای کذاب ازین بیش  
تو کردی دعوی عشق چو من کس چو ز ر دیدی ز من بودت بسی بس  
ز سر تا پا هم دعویت دیدم که در دعویت بی معنیت دادم  
مرا بایست حسرت و چون بچستی یقینم شد کم تو در کار سستی  
مرا گر چستی اسباب و املاک ز رو سیمم ترا بودی هم پاک

Zubaida said to him : " O you in love with yourself, O liar ! what would you do more than this ?

That you claimed to be in love with one like me, but when you saw gold, you had no further regard for me at all ?

I have found you from head to foot nothing but pretence  
I have found you only pretence with no reality.

It was essential to seek *me*, but since you did not do so  
I am assured that you were slack in the affair.

If you had sought *me*, all my goods and lands, all my gold and silver would have been yours entirely."

*Rhyme, Metre, Refrain.*

It is of the utmost importance to see if the rhyme and metre of a verse are correct, since if they are not so, the verse must be erroneous in other particulars also.

If there be a refrain, *radif*, the Copyist, not observing it, may make a rhyme to it, when the rhyme intended is really in the preceding word. Although *double* rhymes often do occur, such inadvertence will, of course, make the text erroneous.

ک must always head a ک allocution or an explanation. B. L. in a verse of Discourse 15, besides having no rhyme infringes this rule :

زبان بکشاده شیخ و گفت ای شاه      کزین شاهى نیايد ننگت ای شاه

B.M., L. E. :

زبان بکشاده شیخ و گفت آنگاه      کزین شاهى نیايد ننگت ای شاه

The Shaikh then opened his mouth and said : “ Are you not, O King, ashamed of this sovereignty ? ”

*Imala, امال*

It should be always borne in mind that, as a rule, a *ma'ruf* sound cannot rhyme with a *majhul*. Thus, if the rhyming syllable in an Arabic word have the vowel sound ā, and this be changed by *imala*, the resulting sound must be *e* and not *i*.

[A Story about Ka'b's daughter and a slave.]

B.L., B.M., I. O., 559, 350 (Discourse 21) :

زعد لش میش و برگ اندر حوالی      بهم برگ آشتی کرد و حالى

Here the Arabic *hawala* becomes by *imala* *havale* to rhyme with the A. P. *hale*.

*Ma'ruf and Majhul. معروف و مجهول*

As mentioned under “ *Imala*, ” a *ma'ruf* sound cannot as a rule, rhyme with a *majhul*. I have met with a few exceptions in the case of *i* and *e*, but they are rare.

As regards *u* and *o*, they are more numerous, but not to a startling extent.

The above is one of the most important rules, for by strict attention to it errors can often be detected, ambiguities removed, and obscure verses elucidated.

Generally speaking, if a *ma'ruf* vowel be seen as a rhyme to a *Majhul*, the verse should be considered erroneous, or at least very doubtful, and attention to the almost general rule is desirable, and not to the comparatively few exceptions which scholars with a pronounced taste for statistics may exert themselves to unearth.

### *Tashif*, تصحیف

By the figure of rhetoric called *tashif* is implied a change of dots or the insertion or omission of them. As a figure of rhetoric this is effected voluntarily, but as regards our subject it may occur through carelessness, inadvertence or the individual judgement of a Copyist in his ambition to edit, and so would come properly under our heading "Dots." As a curious example, however, of how great a change in sense may come from a slight change in the dots may be offered the following from the Story of Ka'b's daughter in Discourse 21.

(As regards the readings of B.M., and B.L., it should be remembered that initial *mim* is often confused with initial *fe*).

B. M. (*Discourse 21*) :

---

بعد ل و داد امیری پاک دین بود      که جدا و ملک را د ر زمین بود

B. L. :

---

کم جدا و ملک را د ر زمین بود      ”

L. E.

---

بعد ل و داد امیر پاک دین بود      کم جدا و ملک را د زمین بود

L. O. 559, 350 :

---

کم جدا و ملک را ن زمین بود      ”



(Of these readings I assume that of B. M. to be the best).

The last two readings would imply that Ka'b was of royal race. He must have been a Governor in Balkh under Nasr b. Ahmad, the Sâmanide, whose predecessor, Isma'îl, took Balkh, Khvârazm, etc. Ka'b seems to have been noted chiefly as being the father of the celebrated female Sûfî known as "Ka'b's daughter," who is the heroine of this Story.

Translation of the distich quoted :

He was a Ruler the purity of whose faith appeared in his justice and equity ; and whose limits were those of the heavens over the earth.

C. E. WILSON.